

**PROSIECT GWYRDD JOINT SCRUTINY PANEL**  
**MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 3RD DECEMBER, 2010**

---

Present:

Councillor C.J. Williams (Vale of Glamorgan Council) (Chairman),  
Councillor D.C. Poole (Caerphilly County Borough Council), Councillors R. McKerlich  
and S. Wakefield (Cardiff County Council) and Councillor S. Howarth (Monmouthshire  
County Council).

Also in attendance:

Councillor M. Stevens (Chair of Prosiect Gwyrrdd Joint Committee); J. Jones  
(Caerphilly County Borough Council); R. Phillips (Cardiff County Council); H. Islet and  
R. Tranter (Monmouthshire County Council); D. Collins (Newport City Council),  
J. Wyatt and R. Bowen (Vale of Glamorgan Council).

Prosiect Gwyrrdd Officers: S. Davies, I. Evans, H. Singh and A. Williamson.

**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from received from Councillor M. Parker  
(Caerphilly County Borough Council), Councillor Mrs. V. Smith (Monmouthshire  
County Council), Councillor S. Jones (Newport City Council) and Councillor  
Mrs. M. Kelly Owen (Vale of Glamorgan Council).

**2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations of interest were received.

**3. MINUTES - 16TH SEPTEMBER 2011**

AGREED - that the minutes of the meeting held on 16th September, 2010 be  
approved as a correct record.

**4) EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

RESOLVED that under Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the  
press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of  
business on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt  
information as defined in Part 4 of Schedule 12A (as amended) of the Act, the  
relevant paragraphs of the Schedule being referred to in brackets after the  
minute heading.

## **5. SCRUTINY OF PROCESS OF SHORTLISTING OF BIDDERS TO 'INVITATION TO SUBMIT DETAILED SOLUTIONS' (16)**

Members received a presentation from H. Singh, Interim Project Manager, Prosiect Gwyrdd, providing an overview of the approved Invitation to Participate in Dialogue (ITPD) and Invitation to Submit Outline Solutions (ISOS) documentation.

Areas covered within the presentation included:

- technology principles
- timetable
- Pre-qualification questionnaire (PQQ) selection
- ISOS requirements
- ITPD structure
- evaluation methodology principles
- evaluation criteria and weightings.

In addition to the above, I. Evans, Procurement Manager, Prosiect Gwyrdd delivered a presentation on the Submission and Evaluation of outline solutions. Notification of the results of this exercise was to be submitted to the Prosiect Gwyrdd Joint Committee on 6th December, 2010.

During the discussion on the above, a number of issues were raised regarding the role of the Joint Scrutiny Panel both to date, and during the remainder of the procurement process. A number of Members were concerned as to the effectiveness of their scrutiny role given the perceived limitations of such in some instances. One area where the Panel's role could potentially be developed over time was that relating to Inter-Authority agreements. In general, Members were looking to ascertain the possibilities for pre-decision scrutiny.

**AGREED - T H A T** Messrs Pinsett Masons, Solicitors (the advisors to Prosiect Gwyrdd) be invited to the next meeting and be requested to outline to the Joint Panel their view as to the legal position regarding the roles/responsibilities of the Panel.

---